



SMART SCALE

*Funding the Right
Transportation Projects
in Virginia*

SMART SCALE Round 3

Recommended Modifications to Staff Scenario



Funding is now available from other sources for several projects recommended for funding

- **\$30.3M for Berry Hill Connector Road (HPP)**
 - Route 58 Corridor Development Fund
- **\$27.9M for Crystal City Metro (HPP)**
 - Transit capital and CMAQ funds
- **\$6.6M for Pentagon City-Crystal City-Potomac Yard Transitway (HPP)**
 - Transit capital

\$91.7M from increase in revenue estimates over the six-year window – divided 50/50 between HPP and DGP

Proposed Distribution of High Priority Project Funds



District	Unprogrammed DGP	Total Additional DGP	Total Additional HPP	Total Remaining to Program for R3
Bristol	\$2,072,013	\$3,065,968	\$9,412,956	\$14,550,938
Culpeper	\$881,022	\$2,884,618	\$8,738,122	\$12,503,763
Fredericksburg	\$702,268	\$3,193,510	\$9,594,980	\$13,490,758
Hampton Roads	\$1,047,923	\$9,137,143	\$27,708,160	\$37,893,226
Lynchburg	\$2,637,350	\$3,241,516	\$9,825,044	\$15,703,910
Northern Virginia	\$268,319	\$9,591,961	\$29,221,918	\$39,082,199
Richmond	\$198,323	\$6,762,796	\$20,254,284	\$27,215,403
Salem	\$2,126,672	\$4,373,658	\$13,122,803	\$19,623,133
Staunton	\$765,260	\$3,588,303	\$10,797,201	\$15,150,764
Total	\$10,699,151	\$45,839,475	\$138,675,467	\$195,214,093

Proposed Modifications - Bristol



- **Swap funding for US Rte. 11 / SR 660 Roundabout South (\$3.6M DGP) for US Rte 11 / SR 660 Roundabout North (\$3.6M HPP) in Smyth County**
- **Fund with DGP**
 - \$0.7M Hillman Highway & Old Eleven Drive Intersection Improvements in Town of Abingdon
 - \$0.8M College Avenue Traffic Signal Synchronization in Town of Bluefield
 - \$4.1M SR 89 at SR 613 Realignment in Grayson County
 - \$1.3M US 58 Alt and US 23 NB Off-Ramp Modification in the City of Norton

Proposed Modifications – Bristol continued



- **Fund with HPP**
 - \$2.8M Lee Highway and Euclid Avenue Roundabout in City of Bristol
 - \$0.8M Russell Road & Poplar Street Intersection Improvements in Town of Abingdon
 - \$4.5M US Route 52 Intersection Safety Enhancements in Bland County

Proposed Modifications - Culpeper



- **Unfund**
 - Rte. 29/Freemans Ford Road Alternative Intersection due to cancellation by Fauquier County BOS (\$7.1M DGP)
- **Fund with DGP**
 - \$3.0M Rte. 29 & Rte. 662 (Shelby Rd.) Intersection Improvements in Madison County
 - \$5.9M Preston Ave. & Grady Ave Intersection Improvements in the City of Charlottesville
- **Fund with HPP and remaining DGP**
 - \$8.8M US 250/Route 20 Intersection Improvement in Albemarle County

Proposed Modifications - Fredericksburg



- **Unfund**
 - New Commuter Parking Lot on Route 3 submitted by FRED Transit (\$5.1M HPP)
- **Fund with HPP**
 - Fund Harrison Rd. & Salem Church in Spotsylvania County (\$6.1M HPP)
 - Swap Rte. 3 STARS Study Improvements (\$6.4M HPP) for Rte. 3 STARS Study and I-95 off-ramp improvement submitted by GWRC for a reduced amount of \$9.2M HPP due to additional funding provided by FAMPO
- **Fund US Rte. 1/Fall Hill Avenue Intersection Improvements in City of Fredericksburg using \$3.6M DGP + \$3.6M HPP**

Proposed Modifications – Fredericksburg continued



- **Fund Rte. 1/Enon Road Intersection and Roadway Improvements using \$2.3M HPP and \$2.1M DGP**
- **Fund next safety projects based on rank using DGP**
 - Route 206 and Route 218 Right Turn Lane in King George County (\$2M)
 - Kilmarnock Right Turn Lane in Lancaster County (\$1.1M)
 - Expanded Turn Lane for Flat Iron Road in Westmoreland County (\$1.0M)
 - Route 360/619 in Richmond County (\$1.3M)

Proposed Modifications – Hampton Roads



- **Fund Existing Cost Increases on Round 1 and 2 Projects**
 - \$11.0M for Laskin Road Projects in the City of Virginia Beach
 - \$330K DGP for Stone Road in Northampton County
 - \$157K DGP for Rte. 13 Industrial Park Traffic Light
- **Fund with DGP**
 - \$3.7M Victory Blvd Enhancement App 2: Poquoson Segment in the City of Poquoson
 - \$6.0M Mt Pleasant Road/Great Bridge Bypass Interchange Improvement in the City of Chesapeake
 - \$8.8M Little Back River Peak Directional & Two Way Left Turn Lane in the City of Hampton
- **Fund with HPP**
 - \$4.1M Seaboard Coastline Trail Segment 1 in Suffolk
 - \$1.1M Median crossover to Rte. 13 in Northampton
 - \$3.2M Rte. 460 at Rte. 258 Turn Lane Improvements in Isle of Wight

Proposed Modifications – Lynchburg



- **Fund through other means**
 - Southern Virginia Mega Center in the City of Danville (\$30.9M HPP)
- **Unfund**
 - \$6.1M Langhorne and Vassar Roundabout
- **Fund Rte. 221 Intersection Improvements in City of Lynchburg using \$8.2M HPP and \$8.5M DGP**
- **\$3.4M Route 58 WBL from Airport Dr to Kentuck Rd in the City of Danville using DGP**

Proposed Modifications – Northern Virginia



- **Fund through other means**
 - Crystal City Potomac Yard Transitway Southern Extension submitted by Arlington Transit (\$6.6M HPP)
 - Crystal City Metro East Entrance submitted by Arlington Transit (reduce from \$52.9M to \$25M HPP)
- **Fund with HPP**
 - DASH Zero Emission Fleet Expansion to a reduced amount based on corrected cost (\$12M HPP)
 - South Elden Street Corridor Improvements in Town of Herndon (\$16.0M HPP)
- **Fund with DGP**
 - Intersection Improvements at Old Bridge Rd and Occoquan Rd in Prince William County (11.8M DGP)

Proposed Modifications – Richmond



- **Fund with DGP**
 - \$2.5M Jude's Ferry Road & Rte. 60 in Powhatan County
 - \$3.5M Intersection Improvements at Rte. 460 & Queen Street in Prince George County
- **Fund with HPP**
 - \$3.3M Rte. 1 (Falling Ck. Wayside - Food Lion) Bike/Ped Improvement in Chesterfield County
 - \$4.9M Shockoe Bottom BRT Station Pedestrian Safety/Streetscape submitted by GRTC
- **Fund W. Broad Street Pedestrian and Transit Improvements in Henrico County (\$9.8 HPP+\$1.0M DGP)**

Proposed Modifications – Salem



- **Fund with DGP**
 - \$2.1M Claudville Hwy Intersection Improvement in Patrick County
 - \$2.0M E. Stuart Drive Sidewalk Project - Phase II in the City of Galax
- **Fund with HPP**
 - Rte. 419 and Rte. 220 Diverging Diamond Interchange in Roanoke County using \$10.1M HPP+\$1.6M DGP – Roanoke TPO has approved up to an additional \$7M to fully fund the project
- **Fund Camp Jaycee Road (Route 697) Intersection at US460 using \$2.9M HPP+ \$0.8M DGP in Bedford County**

Proposed Modifications – Staunton



- **Unfund**
 - Rte. 254 – Rte. 640 Intersection Safety Project in August County for \$1.2M DGP
- **Fund**
 - \$0.9M US 33 & Rt 620 Turn Lanes in Rockingham County
 - \$2.5M Shenandoah Co. / Oranda Road Park and Ride Expansion in Shenandoah County
 - \$4.3M Woodrow Wilson Complex Short Term Access Improvements in Augusta County
 - \$7.6M Fund US 33 (Market Street) and I-81 Exit 247 Improvements submitted by Harrisonburg-Rockingham MPO
 - \$0.9M I-81 Exit 313 Bridge Capacity Improvement submitted by Win-Fred MPO using an additional \$3.3M in non SMART SCALE funds from recently completed I-81 Exit 310 and 313 study projects

Next Steps



- **Votes on modifications to staff recommended scenario at action meeting**
- **Votes on Final SYIP at June meeting**

Concerns Expressed about SMART SCALE in NOVA



“...January set of recommendations are so biased against roads that there is no doubt the statutory directive ... [identifying projects for funding based on bang for the buck] ... has been tossed out the window”

Bang for the Buck on Congestion Relief



Project	Congestion Score per \$10M in Requested Funding*	Recommended for SMART SCALE
I-95 SB Auxiliary Lane (exit 160 to 158)	11.2	N – Funded with 95 Concession \$
Fairfax Blvd/Warwick Ave Intersection Improvements	10.8	Y
Transit Signal Priority on Major Corridors	5.9	Y
West End Transitway	5.3	Y
Crystal City-Potomac Yard Transitway Southern Extension	2.7	Y
Richmond Highway Bus Rapid Transit	2.2	Y
DASH Fleet Expansion	1.9	N
Route 1 / Route 123 Interchange Improvements	1.9	N
Crystal City Metro Second Entrance	1.7	Y
Route 7 Widening (Route 9 to Dulles Greenway)	1.5	N

* Scores without the Hampton Roads Bridge Tunnel

Bang for the Buck on Congestion Relief



- Seven of top 10 ‘bang for the buck’ congestion projects are funded
- Crystal City Metro Second Entrance had 92% of the congestion benefits per dollar spent, so why was it selected?

	Safety	Access	Enviro	Econ Dev	Land Use	Cong	Final Score
Crystal City Metro	0.03	0.32	1.03	0.24	3.78	1.71	7.11
Route 1/ Route 123 Interchange	0.04	0.21	0.26	0.01	0.10	1.85	2.46
DASH Fleet Expansion	0.06	0.31	0.84	0.09	3.25	1.92	6.47

Concerns Expressed about SMART SCALE in NOVA



Prince William, a fast-growing county with some of the most congested roads in Virginia. The staff recommended scenario did not recommend any funding for the County this Round. That alone is overwhelming evidence that the system is rigged.

Transportation Needs are Regional not Local



- **Majority of residents in Northern Virginia commute outside their home jurisdiction for work**
 - 62.5% of Prince William County residents
 - 53.9% of Loudoun residents
- **Transportation needs do not start and stop at the county line**

Transportation Needs are Regional not Local



- **Construction funds used to be distributed to guarantee each jurisdiction a set amount of funding annually**
- **In 2015 after hours of debate, the General Assembly eliminated these programs in favor of a new formula**
 - Allowed for full funding of larger projects
 - Ensured the ‘best bang the buck’ projects in each district and statewide

Secondary vs. SMART SCALE



	Secondary Program	SMART SCALE (Rd2 + Rd3)	Delta
Loudoun	~\$18M	\$80M+	\$60M+
Prince William	~\$22M	~\$50M	\$28M+

Concerns Expressed about SMART SCALE in NOVA



Biggest gripe is when good road projects that will fix congestion are passed over for projects whose potential is primarily economic development, there is proof we do not have an objective, fair and transparent ranking system that adheres to the will of the General Assembly.

Bang for the Buck on Congestion Relief



Project	Congestion Score per \$10M in Requested Funding*	Recommended for SMART SCALE
I-95 SB Auxiliary Lane (exit 160 to 158)	11.2	N – Funded with 95 Concession \$
Fairfax Blvd/Warwick Ave Intersection Improvements	10.8	Y
Transit Signal Priority on Major Corridors	5.9	Y
West End Transitway	5.3	Y
Crystal City-Potomac Yard Transitway Southern Extension	2.7	Y
Richmond Highway Bus Rapid Transit	2.2	Y
DASH Fleet Expansion	1.9	N
Route 1 / Route 123 Interchange Improvements	1.9	N
Crystal City Metro Second Entrance	1.7	Y
Route 7 Widening (Route 9 to Dulles Greenway)	1.5	N

* Scores without the Hampton Roads Bridge Tunnel

Concerns Expressed about SMART SCALE in NOVA



“My office has worked with Loudoun and Prince William counties to come up with a revised scoring that more closely follows the General Assembly’s original instructions, prioritizing congestion relief while funding a fair mix of roads and transit”

What If Congestion were 65% of the Score ?



Delegate LaRock requested staff run a revised score for Round 3 using the following assumptions:

- **No Hampton Roads Bridge Tunnel**
- **Change the following weights of factors in Area Type A**
 - Congestion 65% up from 45%
 - Accessibility 7.5% down from 15%
 - Land Use 7.5% down from 20%

What If Congestion were 65% of the Score ?



Top 12 projects in Northern Virginia are essentially unchanged

- **West End Transitway is #5 up from #10**
- **Richmond Highway BRT is #8 up from #13**
- **Crystal City Metro is #9 – no change**
- **95 SB Auxiliary Lane is #2 up from #14**

Why Didn't Highway Projects In NOVA Score Better?



Over the last 4 years, more than \$4.5 billion has been programmed to major regional highway projects

- \$2.4B for 66 Outside the Beltway
- \$500M for 395 Express Lanes
- \$500M for 95 Express Lanes
- \$550M for 495 Express Lanes
- \$300M for Route 7
- \$200M for Route 234 and Balls Ford Road
- \$125M for 66 Inside the Beltway

Concluding Thoughts



Taking politics out of project selection and using objective criteria is not easy

Some years a jurisdiction may win, while in other years they may not

This does not mean the system is inherently broken

No process is perfect and we should always look for opportunities to improve